



Minutes
ZONING & DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
JANUARY 9, 2007 - 6:00 pm
Town Hall, 6550 Yount Street, Yountville

1. Call to Order

Chair Halliday called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

2. Introduction of New Assistant Planner Katie Hogan

3. Roll Call

Present: Boardmembers Gervasio, Judah, Denton, Lamborn & Chair Halliday

Absent: None

4. Adoption of Agenda

On a motion by Boardmember Denton, seconded by Boardmember Gervasio, the Agenda was adopted unanimously.

5. Approval of Minutes November 14, 2006

Planning Director Tiernan informed the Board that minutes were not present from the November 14, 2006 meeting, but would be distributed to the Board at a later date. He also requested that the draft minutes from the October 10, 2006 meeting be reviewed and the questions regarding Boardmembers' statements be answered by the Board.

6. Public Comment

None

7. Presentation & Discussion – Design Review; 06-DR-13, Shelley Claudel, 2050 Starkey Street

Site Location: 2050 Starkey Street

Subject: A proposal to demolish an existing single-family dwelling and construct a new ±1000 sq. ft. single-family dwelling with a 200 sq. ft. attached garage.

Boardmember Judah dismissed self from discussion due to conflict of interest.

Planning Director, Bob Tiernan presented the staff report.

Applicant, Shelley Claudel and architect, George Ash, were present to answer questions.

ZDRB Design Review comment and recommendations for Claudel residence were as follows:

Halliday

- Q: Have there been any complaints from the neighbors regarding the balconies? A: No.

Gervasio

- Q: Does the notice to neighbors include the building plans? A: No, they are notified that they may come to the Town Hall to review the building plans and may attend the ZDRB meeting to voice their concerns.
- Voices concern that the balconies may encroach upon the neighbors' privacy.

Architect Ash commented on staff report and project and answered questions by the Board:

- The chimney width has been reduced to only what is necessary for code.
- The east balcony has a view of the west side of the adjoining garage, which has no windows. Furthermore, to the north of the garage is a covered patio.

- In order to increase the privacy of neighbors, a solid side could replace the iron railing around the balcony.
- The balconies are primarily for architectural purposes and the residents will rarely sit on them.
- The updated plans show the stone base of the columns to be straight and not flared.

Halliday:

- Opens the discussion to Boardmembers to voice their questions and concerns.

Gervasio:

- Q: Does the door in the garage swing in towards the steps inside the garage? A: Yes, but this should not be a problem. The step functions as a wheel stop and a means to reach the inside floor level. This problem can be rectified, as the door can swing either way.

Lamborn:

- Q: Does the stucco finish look exactly like that on the materials board? A: No, the example shows only the stucco color, not exact texture.
- Q: Will they be removing the worn silk tree in the front yard, or is it in the public right of way? A: Although they would like to, they will not necessarily remove this tree as it is in the public right of way. Tiernan notes that the Town will coordinate with the owner on this matter.
- Q: Do the plans use the surveyor's baseline? A: Yes, they do.
- Q to staff: Are the balconies subject to second floor setback requirements? A by Tiernan: No, they are not, as they are architectural elements projecting from the building.

Denton:

- Notes that as shown, the second floor rooms have a high volume and 9 foot ceiling height, which is higher than the 8 foot first floor. Both parties agree that the second story roof plate and ridge height will be lowered by one foot to equalize the ceiling heights.
- Q: What will the new chimney cap material be other than the corrugated aluminum shown? A: Will be a copper shroud now. Also notes that the chimney height will be lowered one foot.
- Concerned that due to the 10 foot width of the garage, the car doors will not be able to completely open and there will not be adequate storage.
- Also concerned with the visual look of the garage in the historic district. Suggests that a fixed car port with storage shed be considered in order to comply with the style in the historic district.
- Ash responds that the garage is in compliance and that it is set back 8 feet from the front porch. Also notes that there will be storage over the garage and bathrooms. Tiernan adds that the storage amount meets code.
- Concerned with the balconies and the narrow lot. Notes that in the past they did not approve side balconies. Side balconies were only allowed when there was a detached garage.
- Notes that there is only one house in the historic district that is entirely stucco, others are a hybrid of stucco and other natural materials.
- Ash notes that stucco is specifically stated as a traditional material in the design ordinance. The look will not be flat and 'monolithic' as this is a small home that fronts various different materials.
- Concerned with the plan to bullnose the stucco around the windows due to the fact that windows in the historic district have been required to have a wood trim in the past. It is agreed that the wood trim on the doors and windows shall be exposed.

Gervasio:

- Q: Is an outdoor fireplace shown next to the back yard hot tub? A by Ash: Yes, this will be placed with a 5 foot setback from the home and lot line to comply with the zoning ordinance.
- Q: What is the proposed water heater that is shown? A: This will be an on demand heater.

Lamborn:

- Notes that would like to see a landscape plan, as this is usually provided with Design Review. It is agreed that these plans will be brought to the next Board meeting.

Tiernan:

- Opens hearing for public comments. No comments given.

Halliday:

- Announces that the public hearing is closed.
- Notes that she has no problems with balconies. Understands that they are intended for architectural and aesthetic appeal. They will brighten the interior of the small home.

Gervasio:

- Reiterates concern that the balconies will intrude upon the privacy of the neighbors. Would like French windows to be used in these spaces instead.

Lamborn:

- Not concerned with the balconies due to the lack of neighbor concern.

Halliday:

- Calls for recommendations to come to an agreement on the balconies.

Ash:

- Suggests that the east balcony remains due to the lack of view into neighboring yard.

Denton:

- Suggests that a rear balcony is considered. Ash responds that a rear balcony will allow for further view of neighboring yards.

Halliday:

- Calls for a motion for resolution.

Denton:

- Q: Do they want to rule with stipulations or have the applicant return with modifications? A by Ash: They would prefer approval with stipulations due to the owners tight time constraints.
- Adds that screened parking is required in the historic district. Tiernan responds that the lack of this is acceptable due to the small lot size. The inclusion of two off-street spots is sufficient.

Gervasio:

- Would like them to return with modifications, but can accept the stipulations due to time constraints.
- Prefers that the west balcony remains because it is not visible from the street due to the chimney.

Denton:

- Wants neither balcony included. Notes that although there are no current problems of privacy, this may change if new homes are built next door in the future.

Halliday:

- Would like both balconies included as they bring the beauty of the outdoors inside.
- Commends the work that has been done to include so much home and with such details in the small lot. Claudel responds that she has desire to improve the neighborhood.

Denton:

- Motions to approve the Design Plan with the following conditions:
The following items are to be presented for approval at the next Zoning and Design Review Board Meeting on February 13, 2007:
 1. Example of the texture and color of the exterior stucco finish.
 2. Example of the roof asphalt shingle color.
 3. Amend the plans and window detail to reflect exposed wood trim on the casements.
 4. Provide a detail of the garage door design.
 5. Landscape plan.The following changes are to be made to the dwelling plan as discussed and approved by the ZDRB:
 1. The wood trim on the windows and doors shall be exposed.
 2. The second story roof plate and ridge height shall be reduced by one foot.
 3. The chimney is approved per the modified plans presented at the hearing.
 4. The second story balcony on the east side shall be omitted; the west side second story balcony shall remain.
 5. Asphalt shingles shall be used for the roofing material.

Lamborn:

- Seconds the motion.

Denton:

- Amends the motion to note that the second story French doors will be replaced with compatible windows on the east side. Also, the first floor roof line will be continued across the east side where the balcony is to be removed.

Halliday:

- Calls for a vote: All are in favor, none opposed.

Boardmember Judah returns to meeting after the item of discussion has been ruled upon.

8. Staff and Board Reports – Bob Tiernan

- Update and discussion of current projects:
 - Villagio Inn & Spa Expansion.
 - Yountville Inn Expansion.
 - Bardessono Inn and affordable housing.
 - Keller Inn and affordable housing.
 - Costello Sogno Master Development Plan.
 - Ghirardi Place Master Development Plan.
 - Knight Property Master Development Concept.

9. Adjournment

- On a motion by Denton, seconded by Gervasio, the meeting was adjourned at 7:15 p.m.